FT ICR cell: How to make the best Evgeny Nikolaev Skolkovo Institute of Science and Technology



Since introduction in 1974 FT ICR continue to be the best in resolving power and mass measurement accuracy!













National High Magnetic Field Laboratory NHMFL (Tallahassee Florida)

From Alan Marshall 10th NA FTMS 21 T talk







Moscow FT ICR instruments

After 47 years since introduction of FT ICR do we understand how it works?



Signals from same m/z ions





 $\Omega(t+\Delta t) \neq \Omega(t) \qquad \qquad \text{Why!?}$

Strange signal forms



Experimental

Simulated

Charged particle in magnetic field



Lorentz force $F = ze^*v^*B = m^*v^2/r$

 $v/r = 2\pi\omega$,

 $ze^*B = m^*2\pi\omega$

 $\omega = B^* ze/2\pi m$ (cyclotron frequency)





Ion motion in electric field free space

To excite cyclotron motion and detect the signal we need to trap ions

ICR Cells (Penning trap)





For superconductive magnets with cylindrical symmetry



Most used cells

Bruker Infinity cell (until 2014)



Thermo LTQ FT (until 2006)



IonSpec Varian



Compensated cells



Marshall group

Gross group

Cells with trapping by pseudopotential





Nikolaev

Bruker-Nikolaev

Cell with segmented trapping electrodes



Bruce

Fancy cells



Coca-Cola cell

Spectroswiss NADEL cell





BIG 7 inches FT ICR cell



Dynamically harmonized cells







Bruker Solarix R&D

NHMFL cell From Alan Marshall 21 T talk PNNL window cell

Dynamically harmonized FT ICR cell for Thermo LTQ FT



Why so many designs? What is the problem?

The first problem was homogeneity of excitation Field distribution

Cubic and cylindrical



Elongated open cell



Elongated open cells

Thermo LTQ FT (until 2006)













BIG 7 inches FT ICR cell



The second problem was:

Why we could not reach resolving power of more than 1 million at m/z close to 1000 Da?

Is it the vacuum problem?

Ion motion in electric field free space







Motion of ions in crossed E/B fields

Cell potential plot in the xy plane of a cubic FT ICR cell. 3 V potential is applied to the trapping electrodes



Motion of ions in crossed E/B fields



Magnetron motion. No excitation of cyclotron motion




Hyperbolic cell







Hyperbolic Penning trap



 $\vec{F} = q(\vec{E} + \vec{v} \times \vec{B})$

Linear dependence of electric field on coordinates in hyperbolic ion trap

Electric field distribution

 $E_x = -\frac{\partial \phi(x, y, z)}{\partial x} = -\frac{2U_0}{R_0^2} x \quad \bigwedge$ $E_y = -\frac{\partial \phi(x, y, z)}{\partial y} = -\frac{2U_0}{R_z^2}y \qquad \bigwedge$ $E_z = -\frac{\partial \phi(x, y, z)}{\partial z} = \frac{4U_0}{R_0^2} z$ \setminus

Potential distribution



$$\frac{\partial^2 z}{\partial t^2} = \frac{4qU_0}{mR_0^2}z$$







https://www.divaportal.org/smash/get/diva2:413035/FULLTEXT01.pdf



In ideal hyperbolic trap all modes of ion motion are independent





Measured frequency

Distribution of potentials in rectangular or cylindrical FT ICR cells



Axial and magnetron frequencies depend on axial oscillation amplitude



The lost of phase coherence is a result of Inharmonicity of a regular FT ICR cell field





Distribution of potentials in hyperbolic (left) and rectangular or cylindrical FT ICR cells (right)







Cyclotron and magnetron frequencies depend on axial oscillation amplitude

Comets in conventional FT ICR cell



Comet in conventional (cubic, cylindrical, "infinity"..) FT ICR cells

$$\omega_{t1} \neq \omega_{t2}$$

Because ion-ion interaction inside comets is changing in time



How do we know about comets?



Nikolaev EN. 9th Asilomar Conference on Mass Spectrometry, Trapped Ions: Principle, Instrumentation and Applications, Sep 27– Oct 1, 1992

Two different approaches to simulation of ion cloud dynamics in FT ICR cell

1. Calculation of ion-ion and ion image charges interaction directly

2. Solving Poisson equation



International Journal of Mass Spectrometry and Ion Processes 148 (1995) 145–157



Evolution of an ion cloud in a Fourier transform ion cyclotron resonance mass spectrometer during signal detection: its influence on spectral line shape and position

Eugene N. Nikolaev^a, Nickolay V. Miluchihin^{b,1}, Masao Inoue^{b,*}

^aInstitute for Energy Problems of Chemical Physics, Russian Academy of Sciences, Moscow 117829, Russian Federation ^bDepartment of Applied Physics and Chemistry, University of Electro-Communications, Chofu-shi, Tokyo 182, Japan

Received 19 August 1994; accepted 31 May 1995

Simulation was carried out on a Fujitsu AP1000 parallel computer, which is a "multiple instruction multiple data" (MIMD) machine with 512 independent 25 MHz processors. (One processor per ion)

We were trying to explain:

Why ICR frequency is changing during detection?



Fig. 1. Experimental ICR frequency of externally produced Cs⁻ ions as a function of time. The three curves correspond to different ratios of cyclotron radius to cell radius.



The Particle-Mesh Method

Dale Mitchell and Richard Smith 1996



Snapshots in *xy* perspective (left) and *zy* perspective (right) at a late time during the detection period. **(a)** 50,000, **(b)**150,000, and **(c)** 350,000 ions.

Solving Poisson equation using supercomputer

Eugene N. Nikolaev; Ron M.A. Heeren; Alexander M. Popov; Alexander V Pozdneev; Konstantin S Chingin:

Konstantin S Chingin;

Realistic modeling of ion cloud motion in Fourier transform ion cyclotron resonance cell by use of a particle-in-cell approach

Rapid Commun. Mass Spectrom. 2007; 21,1-20

Particle-In-Cell Algorithm (first used to describe ion behavior in FT ICR cell by Dale Mitchell and Richard Smith)





Integration the equation of motion



Integration the equation of motion



Cloud of one m/z ions in a cylindrical geometry FT ICR cell



Evolution of ion clouds with different amount of ions in the cell



t = 3.24 ms

Comet in conventional (cubic, cylindrical, "infinity"...) FT ICR cells

Ion clouds in harmonized cells have elliptical cigar like forms



Projection on the plane orthogonal to the magnetic field

Projection on the plane almost Parallel to the magnetic field

How to get rid of these comets?

The simple solution: use hyperbolic cell



Used space

Other approaches







An instrument with a hyperbolic trap, however, suffers at least from inefficient use of the magnet bore and a relatively inaccessible trap interior.





The quadrupolar potential well can also be approximated in a cylindrical or cubic trap by using simple electrode shapes and by optimizing the aspect ratio or by segmenting the electrodes (Gerald Gabrielse)






G. GABRIELSE, L. HAARSMA and S.L. ROLSTON OPEN-ENDCAP PENNING TRAPS FOR HIGH PRECISION EXPERIMENTS

International Journal of Mass Spectrometry and Ion Processes, 88 (1989) 319-332



Harmonization of cell's electric potential (G.Gabrielse 1989)

Tolmachev, A. V.; Robinson, E. W.; Wu, S.; Kang, H.; Lourette, N. M.; Pasa-Tolic, L.; Smith, R. D. Trapped-Ion Cell with Improved DC Potential Harmonicity for FT-ICR MS

Brustkern A.M., Rempel D.L., Gross M.L. An Electrically Compensated Trap Designed to Eighth Order for FT-ICR Mass Spectrometry. J Am Soc Mass Spectrom 2008, 19, 1281–1285

Marshall's group,



PNNL cell

OC-7S compensation configuration







(b)





Gross group

Marshall group

Two main approaches







FT ICR cell with mesh trapping electrodes creating pseudopotential



Wire cell trapping electrode (1 mm distance between adjacent wires)





US 20050242280A1

(19) United States

(12) Patent Application Publication (10) Pub. No.: US 2005/0242280 A1 Nikolaev (43) Pub. Date: Nov. 3, 2005

(54) ION CYCLOTRON RESONANCE MASS SPECTROMETER

(75) Inventor: Evgenij Nikolaev, Moscow (RU)

Correspondence Address: KUDIRKA & JOBSE, LLP ONE STATE STREET SUITE 800 BOSTON, MA 02109 (US)

- (73) Assignee: Bruker Daltonik GMBH, Bremen (DE)
- (21) Appl. No.: 10/833,938
- (22) Filed: Apr. 28, 2004

Publication Classification

(51) Int. Cl.⁷ H01J 49/38

(57) ABSTRACT

The invention describes an ion cyclotron resonance (ICR) mass spectrometer with an ICR trap, the ICR trap having as trapping electrodes two ion reflecting electrode structures operated by RF voltages without any DC voltage. The usual apertured ion trapping electrodes are replaced by multitudes of structural elements, electrically conducting, and repeating spatially in one or two directions of a surface, neighboring structure elements being connected each to different phases of an RF voltage. In the simplest case a grid of parallel wires can be used. The surface of such structures reflects ions of both polarities, if the mass-to-charge ratio of the ions is higher than a threshold.

(12) United States Patent Franzen et al.

(54) MEASURING CELL FOR ION CYCLOTRON **RESONANCE MASS SPECTROMETER**

- (75) Inventors: Jochen Franzen, Bremen (DE); Evgenij Nikolaev, Moscow (RU)
- (73) Assignee: Bruker Daltonik GmbH, Bremen (DE)

U.S. Patent May 6, 2008

US 7,368,711 B2

FOREIGN PATENT DOCUMENTS

31 40 34 FIGURE 7

US 7,368,711 B2 (10) Patent No.: (45) Date of Patent: May 6, 2008

5,019,706 A *	5/1991	Allemann et al 250/291
5,572,035 A	11/1996	Franzen
6,403,955 B1	6/2002	Senko
7,223,965 B2*	5/2007	Davis 250/282

37

Sheet 3 of 5





Cell with trapping electrodes segmented to rings

Chad R. Weisbrod, Nathan K. Kaiser, Gunnar E. Skulason, and James E. Bruce* Trapping Ring Electrode Cell: A FTICR Mass Spectrometer Cell for Improved Signal-to-Noise and Resolving Power *Anal. Chem.* 2008, 80, 6545–6553





Figure 2. Equipotential contour plots are shown for (a) common 2.0 V trapping conditions and (b) the TREC trapping conditions. The voltages for the modulated (TREC) trapping conditions with increasing electrode radius are 0.2, 1.1, 2.0, 2.4, and 2.8 V respectively, as shown on the rings. A dashed line through the cell located at 38% cell radius is depicted.



Figure 3. Radial electric field plots generated at 38% cell radius for both common 2.0 V trapping conditions and the TREC modulated conditions. A trapping potential well generated from the TREC conditions is overlaid to provide perspective.

The lost of phase coherence is a result of Unharmonicity of a regular FT ICR cell field



Distribution of potentials in hyperbolic (left) and rectangular or cylindrical FT ICR cells (right)



Axial and magnetron frequencies are Independent on axial oscillation amplitude



Axial and magnetron frequencies depend on axial oscillation amplitude





Averaging over cyclotron motion







Evolution of ion cloud m/z = 500 Да, Z=1 in 7 T 0.5 s detection time.





Comparison of averaged axial potential







Near parabolic potential up to a cyclotron orbit of 50% of the cell radius.

Harmonic, parabolic potential at all cyclotron orbits.

Isotopic cluster of Cyt C (charge state Z=23)



7T, 21T ; 0.3 sec detection; >100 steps per minimal cyclotron period;

0.0004 sec, 50V p-p excitation "chirp" excitation ; 5V trapping potential

7T Cyt C 100000 charges



Cylindrical, cubic



Hyperbolic, dynamically harmonized



Reserpine. Lab Prototype , Solarix, 300s transient, RP 39,000,000 in magnitude mode



7T R&D, BSA, 51+, RP 1,700,000 28 s transient



IgG1 (MW =147800 Da), 46+, RP 500 000



12T R&D, Enolase Tetramer, MW=**186713** Da, m/z=5835, (6мG/ml), 32+, deconvoluted



The highest mass protein complex isotopicaly resolved (2012)

Peptide spectra fine structure

Substance P, broadband spectrum $C_{63}H_{100}N_{18}O_{13}S_1$













How to evaluate the cell quality?

E.Nikolaev, A.Lioznov Evaluation of major historical ICR cell designs using electric field simulations Mass Spec Rev. 2020;1–22
ers/e.nikolaev/Downloads/ThesisFinalReview2021%20-%20presentation_Lioznov.pdf

presentation_Lioznov.pdf

20 / 48

(

+ 🗄 🔊

150%

Ð

å

^ 🐺

EN

☆

Ø



8°s

S

w

6



(C)

(E)









0

10





10

0

-10

-10

Ó

10



0.98

0.003





-10









The electric field inside any ion cell may be presented as Spherical Harmonic Decomposition

$$\phi(\mathbf{r},\theta,\varphi) = \sum_{l=0}^{\infty} \sum_{m=-l}^{l} A_{lm} Y_{lm}(\theta,\varphi) \cdot \mathbf{r}^{l}$$

We take into account only first significant nonzero terms: $A_{20}r^2Y_{20}$, $A_{40}r^4Y_{40}$, $A_{60}r^6Y_{60}$ and present the main mode of rotation ion frequency as

$$\omega_{+}(\rho, z) = \frac{qB}{2m} + \left[\left(\frac{qB}{2m} \right)^{2} - \frac{q}{m} \{ A_{20} + A_{40} (48z^{2} - 12\rho^{2}) + A_{60} (240z^{4} - 360z^{2}\rho^{2} + 30\rho^{4}) \} \right]^{1/2}$$

The time of comet formation can be estimated as

$$T_{\text{comet formation}} = rac{2\pi}{\max_{\textit{r},\textit{z}}\omega_{+} - \min_{\textit{r},\textit{z}}\omega_{+}}$$



Relative time of synchronized motion of ions in different FT ICR cells

Trap name	A_{20}	A_{40}	A_{60}	t _{comet} , s
Hyperbolic trap	4.3e-01	-2.0e-05	4.5e-06	5.3e+00
Hyperbolic trap with compensating electrodes	4.3e-01	-1.9e-07	2.4e-06	1.8e+01
Cuboid cell	1.9e+00	-2.0e-02	-9.8e-02	3.2e-02
Cubic cell	5.2e-01	4.7e-03	-2.9e-03	2.4e-02
Cylindrical cell	5.3e-01	1.0e-02	-3.6e-03	1.4e-02
Cylindrical trap with compensating electrodes	5.8e-01	2.0e-06	-3.1e-03	3.3e-02
Open cylindrical cell with compensating electrodes	5.3e-01	2.4e-08	-5.9e-04	1.3e-01
Trap with compensating electrodes by Tolmachov	7.6e-01	7.2e-05	-1.3e-03	1.8e-01
Trap with compensating electrodes by Brustkern	5.8e-01	1.6e-02	-3.5e-03	1.3e-02
Dynamically Harmonized Cell or Paracell	1.6e+00	-4.4e-05	2.6e-04	7.0e+00

Dynamically harmonized cells are providing the highest resolving power



Bruker's cell

NHMFL cell

In 2015 we had Milestone events in FT ICR mass spectrometry

Launching two 21 tesla FT ICR mass Spectrometers

In National High Magnetic Field Laboratory NHMFL (Tallahassee Florida)

and in Pacific North West National Laboratory PNNL (Richland, Washington)







From Alan Marshall 10th NA FTMS 21 T talk Solarix R&D



7T R&D, BSA, 51+, RP 1,700,000 28 s transient





Highly developed surface with large «vacuum memory»

- Long pumping time;
- Not highest avalible final vacuum;
- Potential leakage in feedthroughs.
- Closed volume of the cell



«Standard» (closed) DHC



How to "open" dynamically harmonized cell?

It is easy to «Open» a simple Cylindrical Cell Substituting flat trapping electrodes by cylinders



If we substitute in DHC the hyperbolic shape trapping electrodes by cylinders...



We will not obtain hyperbolic field inside the cell!



The 2D-unrolled electrode configuration for a closed DHC

Ill detection electrodes
⇒excitation electrodes
⊗trapping electrodes



The 2D-unrolled electrode configuration for an ideal open DHC



The 2D-unrolled electrode configuration for an ideal open DHC



Reducing number of electrodes

- The set of electrodes shown above creates the needed field, but it is hard to build it.
- We have shown that the electrodes located far from the trap center has low effect on the field inside the working volume of the cell. Thus, we can merge all these electrodes into one.

The 2D-unrolled electrode configuration of realizable open DHC



The ideal and simulated distribution of the electric potential inside the open DHC



Z-component of electric field at different distance (r) from the cell axis

The deviations from the ideal field

The electric field distribution inside the Open Dynamically Harmonized «Zig-Zag» Cell is not absolutely ideal. But the field deviation is bellow numerical errors of simulations. Tired of cells...

Is it possible to get rid of the cell as a **separate** element of FT ICR mass spectrometer?



Trap walls are the walls of the vacuum chamber: Different geometries could be implemented



Open cylindrical cell



Open compensated cylindrical cell

Advantages of vacuum system wall imbedded cell

No feedthroughs (can apply voltages from outside) No wires inside

Extremely low surface (only surfaces of the electrodes) Easy to align to magnetic field

Low diameter of room temperature bore magnet could be used

Is it possible to incorporate an open DHC into the vacuum tube wall?

New Open DHC



The open dynamically harmonized cell could be made from a single cylinder



The cell opened from one side

- Fabrication of ICR trapvacuum chamber consists of the following steps
- 1) A titanium adapter for a CF63 flange is welded to a 62 mm diameter BT1-0 titanium tube
- 2) In certain places on the tube by means of contact welding, pieces of 2mm BT1-00cB titanium wire are welded
 - 3) The pipe is cut into individual electrodes
- 4) Temporary fasteners are installed to hold the electrodes

• 5) A graphite insert is placed inside the pipe, and then the cut points are filled with a special ceramic powder. Then the billet is annealed in the furnace.

The voltage to the cell electrodes could be applied from outside


Amplifier could be installed directly on ICR trap using Flexible PCBs



Open "atmospheric pressure" DHC The gaps are filled with ceramic fusible powders Electrodes are made from nonmagnetic titanium

The titanium and the ceramics have the similar coefficient of thermal expansion, which allows annealing a vacuum system

Detection at multiple frequencies

Detection with more than two electrodes

4 electrode FT ICR cell dipolar detection

4 electrode FT ICR cell quadrupolar detection

2N electrode FT ICR cell multipolar detection





 $\omega_{signal} = 2^* \omega_{cyclotron}$ Double resolution or double speed



 $\omega_{signal} = N^* \omega_{cyclotron}$ N times higher resolution or speed

Detection on multiplied frequencies and on harmonics

 $R=\omega/\Delta\omega$

 $\Delta \omega \sim 1/T$ T is signal duration

If $\omega' = n * \omega$, R' = n * R



СОЮЗ СОВЕТСНИХ СОЦИАЛИСТИЧЕСНИХ РЕСПУБЛИН



(51) 4 H 01 J 49/38

ГОСУДАРСТВЕННЫЙ КОМИТЕТ СССР ПО ДЕЛАМ ИЗОБРЕТЕНИЙ И ОТНРЫТИЙ

ОПИСАНИЕ ИЗОБРЕТЕНИЯ

BURGENTINGAR 13 marsh 13 Merch 1344

К АВТОРСКОМУ СВИДЕТЕЛЬСТВУ

(21) 3922733/24-21

(22) 05.07.85

(46) 30.04.87. Бюл. № 16

(71) Институт химической физики АН

CCCP

(72) Г.Н.Николаев, М.В.Горшков, А.В.Мордехай и В.Л.Тальрозе

(53) 621.384.6 (088.8)
(56) Леман Т., Берси М. Спектрометрия ионного циклотронного резонанса. М.:

Мир, 1980, с.13-41. Патент США № 3742212,кл.250-291,

1973.

(54) ИОННО-ЦИКЛОТРОННЫЙ РЕЗОНАНСНЫЙ МАСС-СПЕКТРОМЕТР

(57) Изобретение относится к области ионноплазменной техники. Ионно-циклотронный резонансный масс-спектрометр (ИЦМС) содержит пластины 1, 2 удержания ионов (И), расположенные по тор-

цам перпендикулярно оси ИЦМС, электроды (Э) 3, 4 возбуждения И в виде полуцилиндров, установленных в одной плоскости торцами друг к другу, детектор 5 И и электронную систему управления и обработки данных. Выполнение детектора 5 И в виде четного числа Э б, 7, размещенных по окружности с центром на оси ИШМС и гальванически соединенных в две группы таким образом, что два соседних Э расположены в разных группах, позволяет расширить диапазон исследуемых масс и увеличить разрешающую способность ИЦМС за счет детектирования сигнала на частоте, кратной циклотронной. Изобретение позволяет исследовать ионно-молекулярные реакции в газовой фазе, особенно И тяжелые биологических молекул. 1 ил.

Soviet Union patent Priority 05.07.1985 Nikolaev, Gorshkov, Mordehai, Talroze Multi-electrode detection FT ICR cell

....<u>1307492</u> A1

S



E.N. Nikolaev, M.V. Gorshkov, A.V. Mordehai and V.L.Talrose, Rapid Communications in Mass Spectrometry, 4 (1990) 144.

Fig. 11. Simulation for 16-electrode cell shown in . Cells radius R = 1. •, experimental amplitudes obtained in [7] for first four harmonics; ______, the result of computer simulation for fixed cyclotron radius, $\rho = 0.1$ and several magnetron radii. Correlation between excitation time and magnetron radius is pronounced.



$$\omega_{\text{signal}} = 4^* \omega_{\text{cyclotron}}$$



3 Ω Detection Geometry



Alan Marshall 13th European FT MS Workshop (Freising) 26 April, 2018

Thank you!

Acknowledgement to

HORIZON 2020 FT ICR network programm